Western Snowy Plover (Charadrius alexandrinus nivosus)
Nest Site Selection and Oyster Shell Enhancement

David L. Riensche1, Sarah C. Gidre1, 2, Nicole A. Beadle1, 3, and Sarah K. Riensche1, 4

1East Bay Regional Park District, 2950 Peralta Oaks Court, Oakland, California 94605
2California Polytechnic State University, 1 Grand Avenue, San Luis Obispo, California 93407
3University of California, Davis, 1 Shields Avenue, Davis, California 95616
4Las Positas College, 3033 Collier Canyon Road, Livermore, California 94551

Abstract.—The Pacific Coast population of Western Snowy Plovers (Charadrius alexandrinus nivosus) is federally listed as Threatened and is as a California Species of Special Concern. To manage, increase in number, and expand the distribution of these imperiled birds in the San Francisco Bay requires detailed knowledge about their nest site selection requirements. We measured the percentage of crushed oyster shells, shell dimensions, number of shells, and total shell surface area for 19 nests of Western Snowy Plover that occurred at the Least Tern Colony at Hayward, California, from 2008 to 2015. Using pairwise t-tests, we compared these measurements to those obtained from 19 randomly chosen non-nest sites. Results indicate that Western Snowy Plovers at this location select nest sites with a greater percentage of crushed oyster shell substrate, more oyster shells, and a greater surface area of shells than paired random sites.

Key Words.—birds; conservation; experiment; habitat enhancement; nesting

The Western Snowy Plover (Charadrius alexandrinus nivosus; Fig. 1) generally nests on bare ground or sparsely vegetated beaches and salt pans adjacent to tidal waters (Robinson-Nilsen et al. 2011). The Pacific Coast population of the Western Snowy Plover was federally listed as a threatened species in 1993 (U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service 2012) and is currently listed as a California Species of Special Concern (California Department of Fish and Wildlife 2015). Western Snowy Plover numbers have decreased due to habitat loss, increased predation, and human disturbance (U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service 2007). To support shorebird conservation goals, Helmers (1992) recommended the implementation of vegetation and predator management programs. For example, by removing sandbar vegetation at restored sites for Piping Plovers (Charadrius melodus) and Interior Least Terns (Sterna antillarum ahalassos), nesting success improved due to the lack of vegetation, which also minimized the effects of predators (Thompson et al. 1997; Kruse et al. 2001). Other researchers have focused on the removal of non-native plants such as the invasive iceplant (Carpobrotus spp.) as an essential tool to encourage Western Snowy Plover nesting (Kelly Melissa, unpubl. report). Previous studies have suggested that Western Snowy Plovers may select nest sites based on the amount of oyster shell substrate (Zarnetske et al. 2010), which provides camouflage for eggs and chicks and potentially protects them from blowing wind and sand (Pearson et al. 2009). At the Hayward Regional Shoreline, on the eastern shore of San Francisco Bay in California, where oyster shell substrate has been added, observers reported the negative effects that Killdeer (Charadrius vociferus) have on Western Snowy Plovers when nesting in close proximity (Riensche et al. 2010).

Since 2001, the East Bay Regional Park District has managed nesting habitat for the California Least Tern (Sterna antillarum browni) at the Hayward Regional Shoreline by augmenting the amount of oyster shells at the site annually (Riensche 2007). As has happened elsewhere in coastal California (Powell and Collier 2000), these management efforts have resulted in the attraction of breeding Western Snowy Plovers to the site (Riensche et al. 2010). We used data from 19 nest sites of Western Snowy Plovers that occurred at the Hayward California Least Tern Colony from 2008–2015 to investigate the effectiveness of adding crushed oyster shell addition as habitat enhancement for plovers.

Figure 1. Western Snowy Plover (Charadrius alexandrinus nivosus) on the eastern shore of the San Francisco Bay, California. (Photographed by Daniel I. Riensche).
**Methods**

*Study site.*—The study site was at Island Five (37.629739°N, 122.146039°W) within a brackish water marsh of the Hayward Regional Shoreline, located on the eastern shore of the San Francisco Bay, California. Island Five is 0.24 ha (0.6 ac) in size and is one of 15 islands created within a man-made marsh system. We found nests of Western Snowy Plovers (Fig. 2) by systematically walking through the colony during the breeding season while performing Type One In-colony Surveys of California Least Tern nests (Marschalek 2005). In this method, biologists permitted to work on California Least Terns and their assistants enter the colony to mark nests and record the number of eggs and chicks. This type of intensive monitoring is conducted twice a week, yielding data on clutch size, hatching success, and any evidence of predation. We included all 19 nests we found from 2008 to 2015 in the data analysis (Fig. 3). In this method, biologists permitted to work on California Least Terns and their assistants enter the colony to mark nests and record the number of eggs and chicks. This type of intensive monitoring is conducted twice a week, yielding data on clutch size, hatching success, and any evidence of predation. We included all 19 nests we found from 2008 to 2015 in the data analysis (Fig. 3). In a 1-m² area surrounding each nest site, we recorded the substrate composition (percentage crushed oyster shell vs. percentage sand), number of oyster shells (with a surface area greater than 8 cm²), and total surface area of oyster shells measured. We also took the same measurements at 19 randomly chosen non-nest sites that were within a 5-m radius of the active nests. To determine whether nest sites differed from paired random sites across these parameters, we used pairwise *t*-tests (*α* = 0.05).

**Results**

We found that Western Snowy Plover nest sites differed from paired random sites for composition of the substrate, number of oyster shells, and total shell surface area. Nest sites exhibited significantly more oyster shell and less sand than paired random sites (*t* = 0.00087, df = 18, *P* < 0.001), showing 73% crushed oyster shell and 27% sand on nest sites and 42% oyster shell and 58% sand on the random sites. Nest sites showed a significantly higher number of shells surrounding the nest within 1-m² than did random sites (*t* = 0.00026, df = 18, *P* < 0.001). On average, occupied nests had 11 more oyster shells than random sites (Fig. 4), with oyster shells averaging 42.7 cm² in size regardless of site. Nest sites averaged 28.1 oyster shells and paired random non-nest sites averaged 16.8. Total shell surface area was also higher by approximately 562.5 cm² when compared to the random sites (*t* = 0.00096, df = 18, *P* < 0.001).

**Discussion**

Essential habitat requirements for breeding water birds include nest sites that provide cover in arrangements that minimize predation while also supplying adequate nutritional resources (Kadlec and Smith 1992). Shorebird species such as the American Avocet (*Recurvirostra americana*) and Black-necked Stilt (*Himantopus mexicanus*), which nest among Western Snowy Plovers at the Hayward Regional Shoreline site, require open flats or the sparsely vegetated edges of shallow marshes to breed (Cogswell 1977; Paulson 1993). It has also been suggested that Western Snowy Plovers may choose to nest among California Least Terns due to the increased predator protection provided by the tern colony to the plover chicks through the use of alarm calls and other group defense behaviors (Powell 2001). Understanding the ecological mechanisms that control population dynamics is crucial to successfully managing listed species (Schuetz 2011).

Western Snowy Plovers, a federally listed threatened species and a California Species of Special Concern, select nest sites with unobstructed views of their surroundings to provide more time to leave the nest as soon as a predator is spotted (Colwell 2010). Thus, upon leaving...
they depend on their cryptic eggs to blend into the surrounding environment and to hopefully go undetected by predators. Western Snowy Plovers select for heterogeneous substrates that include rocks the size of their eggs to help better camouflage their nests (Colwell 2010).

The area around the San Francisco Bay contains the largest breeding Pacific Coast population of Western Snowy Plovers (Small 1994). The Western Snowy Plover Recovery Plan calls for the creation, management and enhancement of breeding habitat and the maintenance of an average of 500 breeding adults in the San Francisco Bay, California for a 10-y period (U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service 2007, 2012). The mechanisms by which these threatened shorebirds select nesting sites in this local area have received little attention in the literature. We focused on the importance of nesting habitat; specifically, how oyster shell enhancement effects Western Snowy Plover nest site selection.

While this study had a relatively small sample size, with mostly unmarked birds (with the exception of two males), within an active California Least Tern colony, these results could have important nesting habitat management applications for the Pacific Coast population of Western Snowy Plovers. Western Snowy Plovers are facultatively polyandrous and polygynous (Warriner et al. 1986). In this mating system, females typically choose, mate, deposit eggs, and then desert the males with their broods within a few days after hatching (Page et al. 1995). While the males rear their broods, females are free to find new mates. So, for example in the years of multiple nesting attempts (2008 to 2012, and 2014) at the Hayward site, we had as many as three separate nests all establishing, maintaining, and hatching within the same time period. Therefore we feel it is reasonable to assume that these are all separate breeding birds (with the exception of a female or two who may have had two male partners) and not the individual preference of one re-nesting bird. Females are cryptic and no more than three were seen at any one time, while as many as four separate males were observed. During the course of this study, only two of these males were banded, but no females were banded. The banded males were not seen again in subsequent nesting seasons. The estimated life span of these birds is only 2.7 y (Patton 1994). While males are more likely than females to retain the same territory in consecutive years (Warriner et al. 1986), it doubtful that the same birds would survive long enough to nest at this site for eight years.

With continued research, our findings may be used to better manage Western Snowy Plover habitat by attracting breeding pairs, thereby supporting the Recovery Plan goals for this threatened species. Our results indicate that the addition of crushed and whole oyster shells could improve nesting habitat for Western Snowy Plovers in the San Francisco Bay. This may be a valuable management tool in creating better nesting habitat. Future research could focus on the optimum amount of oyster shell by looking at plover nesting success in relationship to amount of oyster shell at the nest site (Fig. 5).
Acknowledgments.—We would like to express our sincere gratitude to the following institutions that made this work possible: U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Point Blue Conservation Science, San Francisco Bay Bird Observatory, East Bay Regional Park District, Regional Parks Foundation, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Coastal Program, Fremont Bank Foundation, Alameda Countywide Clean Water Community Stewardship Program, New United Motor Manufacturing, Orchard Supply Hardware, Johnston’s and Drake’s Bay Oyster Farms, Las Positas College Science Faculty, California Department of Fish and Wildlife, and California State University East Bay Faculty. Special thanks also go to the following volunteers who helped maintain and monitor the site: Patrick Alvarez, George Bloom, Kay Bloom, Emily Brownlee, Nathan Callison, Wade Carlson, Norman Chu, Maggie Clark, Hannah Crosby, Kala Crosby, Rachel Crosby, Janelle Dorcy, Sharon Dulava, Amanda Dwyer, Arthur Garibaldi, Kevin Goe, Tierra Groff, Lisa Henderson, Carin High, Howard High, Kate High, Sam High, Jeanne Jones, Michael Jones, Richard Kaufmann, Anne Krysiak, Sara Lockett, John Mena, Elliot Moon, Martha Morrow, Cody Newell, Caitlin Robinson-Nilsen, Brian Pinomaki, Brianna Pinomaki, Rita Pinomaki, Tyler Pinomaki, Daniel Riensche, Mary Riensche, Nathan Riensche, Rebekah Riensche, Mark Schynert, Adam Shawen, Petra Shawen, Pam Thompson, Pete Thompson, David Wiley, Jon Wiley, and Steve Wiley.

Literature Cited


David L. Riensche is a Certified Wildlife Biologist and Wildlife Biologist for the East Bay Regional Park District where he has worked for over 25 y. For nearly 20 y he has been a member of the Biology Department faculty at Las Positas College, where he teaches courses in biology, ecology, and vertebrate natural history. He is a recipient of The National Association for Interpretation (Region 9) - Outstanding Field Naturalist Award. David holds advanced degrees in both Natural Resource Management and Environmental Education, and has an undergraduate degree in Biology (Wildlife). His current research and habitat restoration efforts are diverse, focusing on the following species and groups: California Least Tern, Western Snowy Plover, Black Skimmer (Rynchops niger), Forster’s Tern (Sterna forsteri), Western (Aechmophorus occidentalis) and Clark’s (Aechmophorus clarkii) Grebes, Bald Eagle (Haliaeetus leucocephalus), Ridgway's Rail (Rallus obsoletus), California Black Rail (Laterallus jamaicensis coturniculus), Burrowing Owl (Athene cunicularia), California Red-legged Frog (Rana draytonii), California Tiger Salamander (Ambystoma californiense), Western Pond Turtle (Emys marmorata), Salt Marsh Harvest Mouse (Reithrodontomys raviventris), San Francisco Dusky-footed Woodrat (Neotoma fuscipes annectens), Central California grassland lizards and small mammals, riparian and oak woodland breeding bird community structure, nesting shorebird populations, upland gamebirds, and waterfowl management. (Photographed by Sarah K. Riensche).

Sarah C. Gidre is a senior at California State Polytechnic in San Luis Obispo and will graduate receiving her Bachelor of Science in June of 2016. She worked as a wildlife intern for East Bay Regional Park District during the summer of 2014 and 2015 gaining experience working with Western Snowy Plovers, California Least Terns, Forster’s Terns (Sterna forsteri), Western Pond Turtles (Emys marmorata), California Red-legged Frogs (Rana draytonii), and Salt Marsh Harvest Mice (Reithrodontomys raviventris). (Photographed by David L. Riensche).
Nicole A. Beadle earned her Bachelor of Science from University of California, Davis in 2015. She worked as a summer wildlife intern for East Bay Regional Park District in 2014 where she collected data and worked with Western Snowy Plovers, California Least Terns, Western Pond Turtles (*Emys marmorata*), and Salt Marsh Harvest Mice (*Reithrodontomys raviventris*). (Photographed by David L. Riensche).

Sarah K. Riensche is a fifth-generation Californian who loves exploring and writing about the Golden State’s many natural wonders. She has volunteered thousands of hours conducting bird and wildlife research and participating in habitat improvement projects for special status species. For over a dozen years she has helped monitored nesting California Least terns, Western Snowy Plovers, Black Skimmers (*Rynchops niger*), Forster’s Terns (*Sterna forsteri*), Western (*Aechmophorus occidentalis*) and Clark’s (*Aechmophorus clarkia*) Grebes, and Bald Eagles (*Haliaeetus leucocephalus*). Sarah has participated in survey and monitoring efforts for California Red-legged Frog (*Rana draytonii*), California Tiger Salamander (*Ambystoma californiense*), Salt Marsh Harvest Mouse (*Reithrodontomys raviventris*) and performed radio telemetry tracking of nesting Western Pond Turtles (*Emys marmorata*). Her written contributions have appeared in *Pointing Dog Journal*, *California Waterfowl*, and in local conservationist newsletters. She is interested in pursuing a degree and career in outdoor journalism and science writing. (Photographed by David L. Riensche).